

**REEVALUATING CORRECTIONAL SECURITY EFFECTIVENESS AMIDST
OVERCAPACITY CRISIS: AN EMPIRICAL STUDY AND THEORETICAL
ANALYSIS AT CLASS IIB WAY KANAN PRISON**
*Deconstructing 'Effective Security' via Empirical Seizure Metrics, Dynamic
Discretion, CPTED Audits, and Multi-Tiered Legislative Reform*

Yoga Pratama Fitrianto,^{*)}

Corresponden: Yogapratama061114@gmail.com

Mulyadi Tanzili,^{*)}

Ismail Pettanase^{*)}

(Diterima 2 Agustus 2026, disetujui 26 Agustus 2026)

ABSTRACT

Conventional institutional assessments frequently characterize penal security as 'effective' based on binary outcomes such as the absence of mass escapes or major riots. This article challenges this analytical assumption by investigating Class IIB Way Kanan Prison, a rural Indonesian penology facility housing 638 inmates within an authorized design capacity of 250 (a 255% overcapacity rate), monitored by a total staff of 65 and an active guard shift of only 8 to 9 officers (a 1:75 guard-to-inmate ratio). Addressing core analytical contradictions in prior literature, this study operationalizes security through empirical metrics: contraband confiscation logs (mobile phones, improvised weapons, illegal wiring), physical surveillance blind-spot mapping, and qualitative narratives from field officers and inmates. Grounding the analysis in five criminological and legal frameworks—Bentham's Panopticon failure, François Génys's Ethical Free Law, Mochtar Kusumaatmadja's Legal Development Theory, Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED), and Rational Choice Theory—the findings demonstrate that facility stability is maintained not through absolute physical deterrence, but through a state of 'vulnerable operational resilience' reliant on informal administrative discretion, dynamic officer negotiation, and inmate self-governance. To bridge the gap between normative mandates under Law No. 22 of 2022 and penal reality, the paper advances actionable recommendations spanning legislative decriminalization of drug users, risk-indexed staffing models, and technological smart CPTED integration.

Keywords: Correctional Security, Overcapacity, Empirical Penology, Administrative Discretion, , Law No. 22 of 2022.

^{*)} Master of Law Program, Postgraduate School, Universitas Muhammadiyah Palembang

^{*)} Master of Law Program, Postgraduate School, Universitas Muhammadiyah Palembang

^{*)} Master of Law Program, Postgraduate School, Universitas Muhammadiyah Palembang

ABSTRAK

Penilaian institusional konvensional sering kali menganggap keamanan lembaga pemasyarakatan sebagai hal yang 'efektif' berdasarkan hasil biner, seperti tidak adanya pelarian massal atau kerusuhan besar. Artikel ini menantang asumsi analitis tersebut dengan meneliti Lembaga Pemasyarakatan (Lapas) Kelas IIB Way Kanan, sebuah fasilitas pemasyarakatan di wilayah pedesaan Indonesia yang menampung 638 warga binaan—jauh melampaui kapasitas desain resmi sebesar 250 orang (tingkat kelebihan kapasitas 255%)—serta diawasi oleh total 65 staf dengan jumlah petugas jaga aktif hanya 8 hingga 9 orang (rasio penjaga terhadap warga binaan 1:75). Untuk menjawab kontradiksi analitis utama dalam literatur sebelumnya, studi ini mengoperasionalkan konsep keamanan melalui metrik empiris: catatan penyitaan barang terlarang (ponsel, senjata rakitan, instalasi listrik ilegal), pemetaan titik buta (*blind spot*) pengawasan fisik, serta narasi kualitatif dari petugas lapangan dan warga binaan. Dengan mendasarkan analisis pada lima kerangka kerja kriminologis dan hukum—kegagalan konsep Panoptikon Bentham, *Ethical Free Law* karya François Génys, Teori Pembangunan Hukum Mochtar Kusumaatmadja, *Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design* (CPTED), dan Teori Pilihan Rasional (*Rational Choice Theory*)—temuan studi ini menunjukkan bahwa stabilitas fasilitas tidak dipertahankan melalui pencegahan fisik yang mutlak, melainkan melalui kondisi 'ketahanan operasional yang rentan' yang bergantung pada diskresi administratif informal, negosiasi dinamis oleh petugas, dan pengaturan mandiri oleh warga binaan. Guna menjembatani kesenjangan antara mandat normatif Undang-Undang Nomor 22 Tahun 2022 dan realitas pemasyarakatan, makalah ini mengajukan rekomendasi praktis yang mencakup dekriminialisasi legislatif bagi pengguna narkoba, model penempatan staf berbasis indeks risiko, serta integrasi teknologi smart CPTED.

.Kata kunci: : *Keamanan Pemasyarakatan, Kelebihan Kapasitas, Penologi Empiris, Diskresi Administratif, Undang-Undang Nomor 22 Tahun 2022.*

I. Introduction

Overcrowding in correctional institutions (Lembaga Pemasyarakatan) represents one of the most persistent structural crises facing criminal justice systems across the global South, and particularly within Indonesia (Siregar & Utomo, 2023). Statistically, Indonesian penal facilities routinely operate between 150% and 300% above official spatial capacity, a condition exacerbated by punitive drug enforcement policies under Law No. 35 of 2009 that funnel low-level substance users into custodial detention (Muhaimin, 2020). Within this strained national landscape, Class IIB Way Kanan Prison in Lampung Province provides a compelling case study. Originally constructed to accommodate an authorized maximum of 250 inmates, the facility currently holds 638 incarcerated

individuals—representing a staggering 255.2% density rate. Concurrently, the total institutional workforce comprises only 65 personnel, leaving a mere 8 to 9 custodial officers (RUPAN) per active shift to maintain security across multiple housing blocks. This yields an operational guard-to-inmate ratio ranging from 1:70 to 1:80 per shift.

Normatively, Law No. 22 of 2022 on Correctional Systems mandates a dual mandate: upholding custodial security while guaranteeing humane rehabilitation and inmate rights. Article 1(13) defines security as an integrated continuum of preventive, detective, and repressive measures. However, a major analytical flaw in conventional penological literature and administrative self-evaluations is the uncritical assertion that security is 'effective' simply because a facility has avoided catastrophic riots or high-profile jailbreaks (Sparks et al., 1996; Liebling, 2004). Asserting high security effectiveness under a 255% overcapacity and a 60% staffing deficit without empirical verification presents a fundamental analytical contradiction. Absolute containment in such environments is physical impossible under rigid statutory models.

Contemporary international penological research (Coyle, 2002; Liebling, 2004) emphasizes that institutional order in overcrowded prisons is rarely a function of absolute physical suppression; rather, it is generated through 'dynamic security'—the complex social interactions, informal bargaining, and administrative discretion exercised daily by front-line staff. While prior domestic studies have focused heavily on urban Class I facilities or analyzed legal texts in isolation (e.g., Marbun, 2021), significant empirical gaps remain regarding how secondary rural facilities (Class IIB) manage extreme resource asymmetry on the ground.

This research addresses this empirical and theoretical gap by conducting an empirical socio-legal investigation at Class IIB Way Kanan Prison. Rather than accepting normative compliance at face value, this study operationalizes security through empirical indicators—contraband confiscation logs, guard deployment ratios, physical infrastructure audits, and direct qualitative interviews with custodial officers and inmates.

II. Research Methodology & Empirical Operationalization

This study adopts an empirical socio-legal research design (Muhaimin, 2020), integrating quantitative operational statistics with qualitative field evidence collected between mid-2023 and mid-2024 at Class IIB Way Kanan Prison. To eliminate analytical ambiguity, 'security effectiveness' was deconstructed and operationalized into four measurable empirical dimensions:

- 1. **Physical Perimeter Containment & Contraband Penetration Index:** Quantified through official quarterly contraband seizure logs resulting from routine sweeps and unannounced inspections (Inspeksi Mendadak).
- 2. **Visual Inspection & Surveillance Coverage:** Evaluated via architectural site audits mapping camera (CCTV) blind spots, perimeter lighting, and line-of-sight blockages within inmate residential cells.
- 3. **Staff-to-Inmate Ratio & Operational Response Time:** Calculated using active shift duty rosters against real-time inmate population figures during peak and off-peak hours.
- 4. **Qualitative Narrative & Discretionary Compromise Rate:** Captured via in-depth semi-structured interviews with 12 key internal actors (Head of Security/KPLP, RUPAN shift officers, block leaders/tamping, and general inmates).

III. Results & Field Evidence

3.1. Institutional Resource Deficits and Staffing Disparities

Field data gathered from Class IIB Way Kanan Prison illustrates a severe structural imbalance between mandated security objectives and operational resources. As outlined in Table 1, the facility operates under severe overcrowding and staffing deficits.

Operational Metric	Authorized Standard	Actual Field Value	Variance / Operational Impact
Inmate Population	250 Inmates (Design Cap.)	638 Inmates	+388 Inmates (+255.2% Overcapacity)
Total	120 Personnel	65 Personnel	-55 Personnel (-45.8%)

Personnel	(Standard IIB)		Workforce Deficit)
Custodial Officers / Shift	20–25 Officers / Shift	8–9 Officers / Shift	60% Reduction in Supervisory Force
Guard-to-Inmate Ratio	1 : 10 to 1 : 15 (Standard)	1 : 70 to 1 : 80	Severe Physical Control Bottleneck

Table 1: Operational Capacity, Staffing Ratios, and Structural Deficits at Class IIB Way Kanan Prison (2023–2024 Field Audit).

3.2. Contraband Seizure Empirical Analysis

The empirical evidence contradicts the notion of impenetrable security. Contraband confiscation records from routine and unannounced sweeps (Inspeksi Mendadak) confirm ongoing perimeter breaches. Table 2 details seized items during the 2023–2024 observation period.

Contraband Classification	2023 Total Seizures	2024 Seizures (Q1-Q3)	Identified Ingress Vector
Mobile Phones / Communication	47 Units	38 Units	Perimeter Throwing & Visitor Concealment
Improvised Weapons (Sharp)	29 Items	21 Items	Fabricated from Maintenance Materials
Illegal Electrical Wiring Taps	84 Sets	62 Sets	Tapped into Cell Light Fixtures
Narcotics / Illegal Pills	12 Incidents	9 Incidents	Concealed in Permitted Visitor Food

Table 2: Quarterly Contraband Confiscation Logs and Ingress Vectors at Class IIB Way Kanan Prison (2023–2024).

"With only 8 guards on shift to supervise over 600 inmates spread across multiple housing blocks, 24/7 physical surveillance is humanly impossible. We rely heavily on senior inmate block representatives (tamping) to maintain internal order and report acute friction before it erupts into open violence."

— Head of Security (KPLP), Class IIB Way Kanan Prison (In-Person Interview, August 2024)

"The cells are extremely crowded, especially during the dry season. If officers enforced rigid formal rules without any flexibility regarding cell doors or out-of-cell movement, the tension would be unbearable. Order exists because there is an unwritten agreement: we keep things quiet, and they grant us basic breathing space."

— Inmate Block Representative (Tamping), Housing Block B (In-Person Interview, July 2024)

The empirical evidence indicates that Class IIB Way Kanan Prison operates in a condition of 'vulnerable operational resilience'. Apparent institutional stability is not the product of flawless physical security or statutory enforcement, but of pragmatic social bargaining and selective administrative discretion.

3.3. Theoretical Synthesis & Structural Analyses

To rigorously analyze the field findings and structural bottlenecks identified at Way Kanan Prison, this section applies five legal and criminological theoretical frameworks:

1. Jeremy Bentham's Panopticon Failure & Visual Surveillance Collapse

Bentham's classic Panopticon architecture relies on the premise of central, pervasive surveillance that instills a psychological sense of constant observation (Bentham, 1791). At Way Kanan, this architectural paradigm collapses. Severe overcrowding has forced inmates to construct makeshift drying racks, internal bed partitions, and privacy curtains. Combined with dead zones in camera (CCTV) coverage and a guard ratio of 1:80, the psychological illusion of surveillance breaks down. Inmates are fully aware of guards' visual blindness, shifting control from institutional monitoring to localized inmate autonomy.

2. François Géný's Ethical Free Law & Administrative Discretion

François Géný's Free Law Movement (*libre recherche scientifique*) posits that formal legal codes cannot anticipate all

operational eventualities, requiring officials to exercise equitable administrative discretion (Gény, 1899). At Way Kanan Prison, officers routinely exercise discretion that departs from rigid SOPs. To alleviate extreme heat and frustration in cells packed to 255% capacity, guards grant extended yard access and permit informal block self-policing. While this discretion acts as a vital safety valve against catastrophic riots, it introduces operational ambiguity and reliance on unwritten agreements.

3. Mochtar Kusumaatmadja's Legal Development Theory & Structural Lag

Mochtar Kusumaatmadja's Indonesian Legal Development Theory (*Teori Hukum Pembangunan*) asserts that legal enactments must serve as tools for institutional engineering and societal development (Kusumaatmadja, 2002). Law No. 22 of 2022 normatively elevates rehabilitation and rights protection. However, field evidence demonstrates a pronounced 'structural lag'—legislative mandates have expanded without proportional allocations of capital, personnel, or infrastructure expansion, leaving front-line staff to manage modern legal standards with legacy resources.

4. Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED)

Evaluating the facility against Jeffery's (1971) and Newman's (1972) CPTED principles reveals structural vulnerabilities: (a) Natural Surveillance: Obstructed lines-of-sight from central watchtowers due to structural additions; (b) Access Control: Reliance on manual key-and-padlock mechanisms that delay emergency response during multi-block incidents; (c) Territorial Reinforcement: Vulnerable outer perimeter walls subject to contraband throwing.

5. Clarke & Cornish's Rational Choice Perspective

Cornish & Clarke's (1985) Rational Choice Theory explains offender behavior as a calculated evaluation of risk, effort, and immediate reward. In an environment where guard presence is diluted to 1:80, the perceived risk of detection for smuggling mobile phones or electrical wiring drops significantly. Given the high utility of

external communication, inmates rationally choose contraband acquisition, driving continuous demand.

3.4. Actionable & Policy-Oriented Recommendations

To replace precarious informal compromises with sustainable institutional security, this study presents a three-tier action plan:

1. Macro-Level Legislative & Criminal Justice Reforms

- a. **Overhaul of Narcotics Legislation (Law No. 35/2009):** Decriminalize personal drug consumption and mandate medical/social diversion programs. Over 55% of Way Kanan's population consists of minor drug users; diversion would immediately alleviate overcapacity.
- b. **Operationalization of Alternative Sentencing (KUHP Law No. 1/2023):** Implement non-custodial options such as community service and probation supervision for non-violent, short-term offenders to reduce institutional inflow.

2. Meso-Level Institutional Governance & Discretion Frameworks

- a. **Risk-Indexed Dynamic Staffing Allocation:** Replace static national staffing formulas with dynamic models that allocate personnel based on actual overcapacity percentages, targeting an immediate 40% increase in active shift guards.
- b. **Standardized Administrative Discretion Protocol:** Formulate clear administrative guidelines under Gény's principles to formalize officer discretion, establishing transparent boundaries to prevent corruption or selective favoritism.

3. Micro-Level Technological & Smart CPTED Interventions

- a. **AI-Enhanced Thermal CCTV Surveillance:** Deploy thermal motion-detection cameras along perimeter walls and blind spots to automate surveillance and mitigate physical guard limitations.
- b. **Overhead Anti-Throw Netting & Centralized Electronic Locks:** Install perimeter overhead netting to block throw-over contraband and upgrade manual cell locks to centralized electronic access control systems.

IV. Conclusion

Evaluating correctional security solely through binary outcomes like 'zero escapes' provides an incomplete assessment of institutional stability. At Class IIB Way Kanan Prison, a 255% overcrowding rate and an acute staffing shortage have stretched physical security mechanisms to their limits. The empirical evidence demonstrates that institutional order is maintained through informal administrative discretion, adaptive officer negotiation, and pragmatic inmate self-regulation. Achieving long-term security in line with Law No. 22 of 2022 requires systemic reforms across legislative decriminalization, dynamic staffing models, and technological smart CPTED implementation.

References

A. Books

- Bentham, J. (1791). *Panopticon; or, The Inspection-House*. London: T. Payne.
- Coyle, A. (2002). *A Human Rights Approach to Prison Management: Handbook for Prison Staff*. London: International Centre for Prison Studies.
- Gény, F. (1899). *Méthode d'interprétation et sources en droit privé positif*. Paris: LGDJ.
- Jeffery, C. R. (1971). *Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage Publications.
- Kusumaatmadja, M. (2002). *Konsep-Konsep Hukum dalam Pembangunan*. Bandung: Alumni.
- Liebling, A. (2004). *Prisons and Their Moral Performance: A Study of Values, Quality of Life, and Justice in Prisons*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Muhaimin. (2020). *Metode Penelitian Hukum*. Mataram: Mataram University Press.
- Newman, O. (1972). *Defensible Space: Crime Prevention Through Urban Design*. New York: Macmillan.
- Sparks, R., Bottoms, A., & Hay, W. (1996). *Prisons and the Problem of Order*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

B. Laws and Regulations

- Republic of Indonesia. (2009). Law No. 35 of 2009 concerning Narcotics. State Gazette of the Republic of Indonesia.
- Republic of Indonesia. (2022). Law No. 22 of 2022 concerning Correctional Systems. State Gazette of the Republic of Indonesia.
- Republic of Indonesia. (2023). Law No. 1 of 2023 concerning the Criminal Code (KUHP). State Gazette of the Republic of Indonesia.

C. Journals

- Clarke, R. V., & Cornish, D. B. (1985). Modeling offenders' decisions: A framework for research and policy. *Crime and Justice*, 6, 147-185.
- Marbun, B. N. (2021). Evaluasi Efektivitas Pengawasan Pengamanan Lembaga Pemasyarakatan Berbasis CPTED. *Jurnal Pemasyarakatan Indonesia*, 8(2), 112-125.
- Siregar, H., & Utomo, P. (2023). Dynamic Risk Assessment in Overcrowded Correctional Facilities. *Asian Journal of Criminology*, 18(3), 245-263.
- Suganda, R., et al. (2023). Operational Resilience in Class II Penological Institutions: An Empirical Analysis. *Journal of Indonesian Legal Studies*, 12(1), 89-114.